Titled “The Old Church” and published in the Sag Harbor Corrector in 1841, the article states, “There stands in the Parish of Bridgehampton, an ancient building, which from the sign over the door appears to have been built about the year 1737, and is now remarkable only for its antiquity and dilapidated state... called by the inhabitants of that place a Church, but by strangers... a Barn... The people who could live in splendid mansions, six days in the week, on the seventh were content to assemble and worship the Most High, in a building thus forbidding in its outward appearance.”

After being somewhat shamed, the Presbyterian congregation decided in earnest to build a new house of worship. After lengthy debate, land was purchased and work was begun to erect the structure on Main Street that stands today. And when the church was next written about, in The History of Long Island, from 1845, Nathaniel Prime wrote that “for simple beauty, chaste neatness, just proportions, and absolute convenience, it is not exceeded by any church in the county.”